

CHAPTER IV

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

This chapter presents the research findings and discussions. This research is conducted to answer three research questions. Those are the types of error, the most dominant error made by students, and the sources of error. In order to answer those questions, this chapter is divided into two main sections. The first is findings which present the result found and discussions which contain the explanation of the result found.

4.1 Research Findings

This research is about analyzing students' errors in their writing. The analysis is based on Dulay's theory, surface strategy taxonomy which consists of four types of error. Those are omission, addition, misordering and misformation. Aside from analyzing the types of error, the researcher also analyzes the sources of error based on Brown. According to Brown, there are four sources of error, but in this research only two sources of error that are being used, those are interlingual transfer and intralingual transfer.

The procedure of error analysis is started from collecting the sample. Here the researcher asks the students to write a passage then collect the writing result to be analyzed. The next step is identification of error. Here the researcher identifies the errors in the students' writing. The researcher

compares the sentences made by the students that have error in it to the correct form of sentence to identify what kind of error is made. The third step is the description of error. After all the errors have been identified, the next step is to describe them. Here, the errors are classified into types of error based on surface strategy taxonomy by Dulay. After the description of error, the next step is the explanation of error. In this step, the researcher explains why errors are occurred. The explanation is by classifying the errors based on the sources of error. The researcher classifies the errors only whether it comes from the Indonesian language as the first language (interlingual transfer) or comes from English as the target language (intralingual transfer). The last step is error evaluation. In this step, the researcher makes the recapitulation of the types of error occurred and the sources of the error. It is to know the total of the types of error occurred and also the total of the sources of the error. After doing all the steps, the result can be presented as like below.

Table 1. The Recapitulation of the Types and Sources of Error Made by Students

Students	Types of Error				Sources of Error	
	Omission	Addition	Misordering	Misformation	Inter	Intra
Student 1	6	3	-	8	7	10
Student 2	1	2	-	8	1	10
Student 3	-	-	-	1	-	1
Student 4	1	-	-	2	-	3
Student 5	-	-	-	2	-	2
Student 6	4	-	-	6	3	7
Student 7	2	-	-	3	2	3

Student 8	4	3	1	6	5	9
Student 9	7	1	2	2	6	6
Student 10	1	2	-	-	-	3
Student 11	1	-	-	20	1	20
Student 12	-	-	-	1	-	1
Student 13	4	1	2	5	6	6
Student 14	4	1	2	5	6	6
Student 15	-	-	-	1	1	-
Student 16	1	1	1	1	3	1
Student 17	4	1	-	4	-	9
Student 18	3	-	-	10	4	9
Student 19	5	-	-	5	3	7
Student 20	2	3	-	5	2	8
Student 21	3	2	-	6	2	9
Student 22	5	-	-	5	3	7
Student 23	-	-	-	2	-	2
Student 24	7	1	1	6	7	8
Student 25	6	-	1	11	3	15
Student 26	-	1	1	3	1	4
Student 27	1	-	-	5	-	6
Student 28	1	-	-	2	1	2
Student 29	2	1	-	5	3	5
Student 30	3	-	1	3	3	4
Student 31	2	-	-	3	-	5
Student 32	-	-	-	5	-	5
Total	80	23	12	151	73	193
			266			266

After doing the recapitulation, the next step is to count the percentage of each type and source of error as like below:

Percentage of each type of error:

$$1. \text{ Omission} = \frac{80}{266} \times 100\% = 30,08\%$$

$$2. \text{ Addition} = \frac{23}{266} \times 100\% = 8,64\%$$

$$3. \text{ Misordering} = \frac{12}{266} \times 100\% = 4,51\%$$

$$4. \text{ Misformation} = \frac{151}{266} \times 100\% = 56,77\%$$

Percentage of each source of error:

$$1. \text{ Interlingual transfer} = \frac{73}{266} \times 100\% = 27,44\%$$

$$2. \text{ Intralingual transfer} = \frac{193}{266} \times 100\% = 72,56\%$$

Table 2. Percentage of the Types of Error

No.	Types of Error	Total	%
1.	Omission	80	30,08%
2.	Addition	23	8,64%
3.	Misordering	12	4,51%
4.	Misformation	151	56,77%
	Total	266	100%

Based on the table above, it can be concluded that the omission error found is 80 or 30,08%, addition error is 23 or 8,64%, misordering error is 12 or 4,51%, while misformation error is 151 or 56,77%. From the calculation of the data, it can be seen that the misformation error is the most dominant error

found in students' writing with the percentage of 56,77%. It is followed by the omission error with the percentage of 30,08%. Addition error is in third position with the percentage of 8,64% and in the last place is misordering error with the percentage of 4,51%.

Aside from the types of error, the sources of error made by the students are also found. The errors can happen because there are the sources that caused the students to create errors. The sources of error found are presented below.

Table 3. Percentage of the Sources of Error

No.	Source of Error	Total	%
1.	Interlingual Transfer	73	27,44%
2.	Intralingual Transfer	193	72,56%
	Total	266	100%

In the table above, it can be seen that 73 or 27,44% errors are caused by interlingual transfer. Meanwhile 193 or 72,56% errors are caused by intralingual transfer. It can also be concluded that the major source of error made by the students is intralingual transfer.

4.2 Discussions

4.2.1 Types of Error

The types of error that are analyzed in this research are based on surface strategy taxonomy by Dulay. Those are omission, addition, misordering and misformation.

a. Omission Error

Dulay et al. (1982:154) stated that omission is the absence of an item that must appear in a well-formed utterance. It is an error where learner omits an item or more in their composition. In this research, the omission error is found 80 or 30,08%. It becomes the second highest type of error found in students' writing.

In the students' writings that have been analyzed, the researcher finds that the omission error that is often done by the students are the omission of '-ed' in the past form of regular verb used. For example in the sentence made by Adelia Kartika '*...if my mom is at home, I usually help[...] with cooking,...*'. The correct one should be '*...when my mom was at home, I usually helped her with cooking,...*'. In recount text, the verb should be in the form of past tense, thus the past form of the word 'help' should be 'helped'.

Another example is in the sentence made by Bayu Aminur '*...camp activities start[...] after school...*'. The correct one should be '*...camp activities started after school...*'. The word 'start' is a regular verb, thus the past form should be added by '-ed' too.

Another example of omission error is omitting the object pronoun as like in the sentence made by Adelia Kartika ‘...if my mom is at home, I usually help [...] with cooking,...’, instead of ‘...when my mom was at home, I usually helped **her** with cooking,...’. The student omits the object pronoun (‘her’) that should be existed because the student uses the transitive verb ‘help’ that has to be added by an object to make the sentence complete.

Omission error is also found in the case of subject omission. For example in the sentence made by David Dwi ‘...[...] depart for Bandungan...’, instead of ‘...**I** departed to Bandungan...’. A sentence pattern should have a subject in it. Another example is in the sentence made by Arya Prasetya ‘...sometimes if there is money [...] came out...’. The correct one should be ‘...sometimes if I had money, **I** came out...’.

Omitting ‘to be’ is also often done by students. For example in the sentence made by Desinta Lestyaningsih ‘...our campsite [...] in our own school...’. The correct one should be ‘...our campsite **was** in our own school...’. To be is needed in a nominal sentence and the ‘to be’ that is omitted by the student is ‘was’ because the subject is a singular subject. The error of omitting ‘to be’ is also found in the sentence made by Nafis Sinta ‘...at 2pm the event [...] opened...’. The correct one should be ‘...at 2pm the

event **was** opened...’. The sentence is a passive sentence, thus the ‘to be’ is needed to complete the sentence.

Another example of omission error is done in the sentence made by Bayu Aminur ‘...the activity was finished [...] all students returned home...’. The correct one should be ‘...the activity was finished **then** all students returned home...’. The word ‘then’ here is needed to show the sequence in the sentence.

An omission error is also found in the sentence made by Desinta Lestiyaningsih ‘...this activity lasts for 2 hour[...]...’. The word ‘hour’ should be added by ‘-s’ to show the plural noun. The correct sentence should be ‘...this activity lasted for 2 hours...’.

Omitting preposition also becomes one of omission error done by students. For example in the sentence made by Destia Rahma Putri ‘...[...] the first day I visited...’, instead of ‘...**on** the first day I visited...’. Another example is in the sentence made by Firliyan Agil Pamungkas ‘...and stayed at the hotel [...] 3 hours...’. Preposition ‘for’ is needed to show how long the time is spent in the sentence. The correct one should be ‘...and stayed at the hotel **for** 3 hours...’.

b. Addition Error

In this research, the result shows that the addition error becomes the third highest type of errors done by students. It is

found 23 errors or 86,4%. Addition error is the presence of an item which must not appear in a well-formed utterance (Dulay et al., 1982:156). It is an error when learner adds unnecessary item in their composition.

The addition error is found in the sentence made by Adelia Kartika '*...I went with my three friends **to go** to a tourist place in **the** Kelet...*'. The use of the words 'to go' and article 'the' in the previous example are unnecessary. The word 'to go' is unnecessary because there has been the word 'went' that acted as a verb and shows what is done by the student. Meanwhile article 'the' is unnecessary because Kelet is a name of a place that does not need to be given a definite article when it is mentioned. The correct one should be '*...I went with my three friends to a tourist place in Kelet...*'.

Another example of addition error is in the sentence made by David Dwi '*...to Celosia **then** I order tickets...*'. The correct one should be '*...at Celosia I ordered tickets...*'. The sentence does not mean to tell a sequence of action, thus the word 'then' is unnecessary.

Addition error is also found in the sentence made by Destia Rahma Putri '*...I visited **was** Monas **Jakarta** **there**...*'. The 'to be' (was) is an unnecessary word in the sentence because it is a verbal sentence that does not need to be added by 'to be'. The word

‘Jakarta’ and ‘there’ are also unnecessary because the name of the place is originally only ‘Monas’ and when people read the word ‘Monas’, they will definitely understand that it is located in Jakarta. The word ‘there’ is also unnecessary because it is usually used to show the place but in the previous sentence the name of the place has been mentioned so it is unnecessary to put the word ‘there’. The correct sentence should be ‘...*I visited Monas...*’.

The addition error is also found in the case of the use of ‘apostrophe s’ or (‘s’). The use of ‘apostrophe s’ in English is to show ownership. The example of the addition error is in the sentence made by Hilda Dian ‘...*the drama’s performance...*’. The use of ‘apostrophe s’ in the previous example is unnecessary because the sentence does not mean to show an ownership. The correct one should be ‘...*the drama performance...*’. Another example is in the sentence made by Nafis Sinta ‘...*the woman’s team...*’. What is meant by the student is ‘a team that contain only female students in it’, thus the sentence does not show an ownership. The correct one should be ‘...*the woman/female team...*’.

It is also found in a sentence made by Laiya Khafita Sari ‘...*during the holidays arrived...*’. The sentence contains an addition error because the student puts the word ‘arrived’. The word is unnecessary because it is brought by the student’s

translation from the student's native language. Only '*...during the holiday...*' is correct.

Another addition error is found in the sentence made by Noval Ady Saputra '*...that's my story on new years...*'. The additional 's' on the word 'years' is unnecessary because it does not mean to show any plurality. The correct one should be '*...that was my story on new year...*'.

c. Misordering Error

Misordering error becomes the fewest type of error made by students in their writing. It is found 12 errors or 4,51%. Dulay et al. (1982:162) stated that misordering error is incorrect placement of a morpheme or group of morphemes in an utterance. It is an error where learner places the wrong sequence in a sentence.

Misordering error is mostly found when students write '*...I and my friends...*'. This is often made by the students in their writing. The correct form should be '*...my friends and I...*'.

Another misordering error made by students is in the sentence made by Desinta Lestyaningsih '*...with the aim of inauguration Bantara...*'. The correct one should be '*...with the aim of Bantara inauguration...*'. Another example is in the sentence made by Firliyan Agil Pamungkas '*...with my **body tired**...*', instead of '*...with my tired body ...*'. Both have the same

case. Both are noun phrases that should put the noun behind after the adjective word.

Another example is in the sentence made by Dodi Sulaiman ‘...**there** I saw a beautiful panorama...’. The adverb is better to be put at the end of the sentence. If it is in front, it is better to be added by comma (.). The correct one should be ‘...I saw a beautiful panorama there...’.

d. Misformation Error

Misformation is the wrong form of the morpheme or structure (Dulay et al., 1982:158). It is an error where the learner is failed in choosing the right words. In this research, misformation error becomes the most dominant error done by the students in their writing. The misformation error is found 151 errors or 56,77%.

The most misformation error made by students is when they are supposed to change the present verb into past verb. In this research, the students are asked to make a recount text, thus the verb used has to be in the form of past tense. The examples of misformation error related to verbal words are in these sentences; Bayu Aminur wrote ‘...all students **get** food...’ instead of ‘...all students **got** food...’, Sintia Mega wrote ‘...my friends and I **go** home...’ instead of ‘...my friends and I **went** home...’, Desinta Lestyaningsih wrote ‘...this activity **lasts** for 2 hours...’ instead of

‘...this activity **lasted** for 2 hours...’, Dian Ayu Lestari wrote ‘...who **has** a hobby of reading...’ instead of ‘...who **had** a hobby of reading...’ and ‘...I **don’t** think...’ instead of ‘...I **didn’t** think...’, Diva Faradisha wrote ‘...which only **come** out...’ instead of ‘...which only **came** out...’, Intan Famalin wrote ‘...when we **wake** up...’ instead of ‘...when we **woke** up...’ and ‘...school activities **take** a lot of time...’ instead of ‘...school activities **took** a lot of time...’, Irma Fitrianiingsih wrote ‘...some students **bring** mats...’ instead of ‘...some students **brought** mats...’ and ‘...we **hold** a closing ceremony...’ instead of ‘...we **held** a closing ceremony...’, Noval Ady Saputra wrote ‘...the weather **starts** to change...’ instead of ‘...the weather **started** to change...’, Ulfa Intan Rahmadani wrote ‘...one of them **sells** souvenirs...’ instead of ‘...one of them **sold** souvenirs...’ and ‘...I **eat** meatballs...’ instead of ‘...I **ate** meatballs...’, and others.

The misformation error that related to the word changing is not only happened to verbal words. The use of ‘to be’ also becomes one case of misformation error. The examples are written by Agung ‘...so I **am** sure...’ instead of ‘...so I **was** sure...’, Ahmad Fajrian ‘...which **is** usually...’ instead of ‘...which **was** usually...’, and Bayu Aminur ‘...all students **are** told to...’ instead of ‘...all students **were** told to...’.

The use of modal also becomes one case of misformation error made by students. The modal used has to be changed into past form, but most of students do not do as it is supposed to. The examples of misformation error for modal are in these sentences written by Dian Ayu Lestari ‘...*I think it **will** be...*’ instead of ‘...*I think it would be...*’ and ‘...*that I **cannot** make into reality...*’ instead of ‘...*that I could not make into reality...*’.

Aside from the word changing that becomes problem, the use of suitable word also becomes the case of misformation error made by students. The example is in the sentence made by Adelia Kartika ‘...*I spent it like **usually** by staying at home...*’ instead of ‘...*I spent it like usual by staying at home...*’. In the previous sentence, the adjective one is more suitable to be used. Another example is in the sentence made by Agung ‘...*at noon, I **took a** lunch...*’. The more suitable word used should be ‘...*at noon, I had lunch...*’. The error is also found in the sentence made by Alif Alfian ‘...*I **fell** better...*’. From the meaning itself, the sentence is wrong. The correct one should be ‘...*I felt better...*’. Another example is in the sentence made by Dian Ayu Lestari ‘...*there were various **readings**...*’. The more suitable sentence should be ‘...*there were various stories...*’. Another example is in the sentence made by Heni Sekar Larasati ‘...*we went there **using** car...*’. It was same as the one made by Hilda Dian ‘...*we went to*

ISI with cars...'. The correct ones should be '*...we went there **by** car...*' and '*...we went to ISI **by** cars...*'. Another example is in the sentence made by Nafis Sinta '*...last year, my friends and I **followed** a camp...*'. The word 'followed' is better to be replaced by 'joined'. The better sentence should be '*...last year, my friends and I **joined** a camp...*'. Misformation error is also found in the sentence made by Nafis Sinta '*...after that, the **women** team...*'. The word 'women' is actually not wrong, but because the story is made by a high school student and the story is made to tell their experience, the more suitable word used should be 'female'. The word 'female' is more suitable to be used by a senior high school student. Thus, the better sentence should be '*...after that, the **female** team...*'.

4.2.2 Sources of Error

In analyzing error, the researcher must know why the errors are occurred. There are sources of error. Based on Brown (2007:263), there are four sources of error. Those are interlingual transfer, intralingual transfer, context of learning and communication strategies. In this research, the researcher limits only interlingual and intralingual transfer as the sources of error made by students in their writing.

a. Interlingual Error

Brown (2007:263) stated that the beginning stages of learning a second language are especially vulnerable to interlingual transfer from the native language, or interference. It means that the source of error is from the native language of the learner because the learner has not been familiar with the target language. In this research, the result shows that 73 or 27,44% errors are caused by interlingual transfer.

This research involves students that are learning English as second language and their first language is Indonesian, which means that they should create an English text which has different structure from their first language. Students usually do a translation in doing this work, and from the translation itself then some errors are made. In this research, interlingual transfer mostly causes an omission error where the learner omits items in their sentences that makes the sentence becomes grammatically incorrect and misordering error where the learner does incorrect placement of words in creating sentence. Indonesian language structure does not have differences in creating verbal and nominal sentence, meanwhile English language structure does. In English, creating a nominal sentence requires 'to be' and that is the thing that Indonesian learner often forgets in doing translation. They often

translate each word without paying attention to the grammatical rules and that is why interlingual transfer happens.

The example of omission error in sentences that are caused by interlingual transfer are; Desinta Lestyaningsih wrote '*...our campsite [...] in our own school...*' instead of '*...our campsite was in our own school...*'; Nafis Sinta wrote '*...at 2pm the event [...] opened...*' instead of '*...at 2pm the event was opened...*'. As like stated before, 'to be' is required in creating a nominal sentence but in the previous examples the students do not put 'to be' because they still get interference from their native language. Another example is written by Desinta Lestyaningsih '*...this activity lasts for 2 hour[...]....*'. The word 'hour' should be added by '-s' to show the plural noun, but because in Indonesian language structure there is no such a rule, the students do not put 's' in the word 'hours' to show plurality. The correct sentence should be '*...this activity lasted for 2 hours...*'.

Meanwhile the example of misordering error in sentences that are caused by interlingual error is written by Desinta Lestyaningsih '*...with the aim of **inauguration Bantara**...*' instead of '*...with the aim of Bantara inauguration...*'. It is a noun phrase where the adjective word should be placed before the object. Another example is in this sentence written by Dodi Sulaiman '*...**there** I saw a beautiful panorama...*'. The adverb is better to be

put at the end of the sentence. If it is in front, it is better to be added by comma (.). The correct one should be '*...I saw a beautiful panorama there...*'.

b. Intralingual Error

As like stated by Brown (2007:264) that intralingual transfer contributes a large error compared to interlingual errors in a second language, the result shown by the analysis done by the researcher gives the same result. 193 or 72,56% of errors are caused by intralingual transfer. The intralingual error is the student's error in learning a second language caused by the complexity of the second language system (Asni & Susanti, 2018:136).

English grammar is considered difficult because it requires a lot of things to be learned and as the learner of English as a second language, students usually get difficulties in understanding it, moreover in using it. For example, there are 16 tenses that have different structures that can be used and also the use of the correct preposition and others. In this research, intralingual error mostly causes misformation error where the learner should use the correct form of words needed and addition error where learner should not put unnecessary items in their writing. The use of incorrect word form often happened when the students were asked to make

sentences other than present tense. It was because it required the changing form of word, for example in creating a past tense sentence, students should use past form of words instead of present form of words. Students are also confused whether they should or should not put some items in their writing that lead them to put unnecessary item in the sentences they made. From this complexity in English language, intralingual transfer happens.

The example of addition error in sentences that caused by intralingual transfer is written by Adelia Kartika '*...I went with my three friends to go to a tourist place in the Kelet...*' instead of '*...I went with my three friends to a tourist place in Kelet...*'. The use of the words 'to go' and article 'the' in the previous example are unnecessary. It happens because of the student does not understand completely about the complexity of English grammar. Another example is found in this sentence written by Destia Rahma Putri '*...I visited was Monas Jakarta there...*'. The 'to be' (was) is unnecessary word in the sentence because it is a verbal sentence that does not need to be added by 'to be'. The word 'Jakarta' and 'there' are also unnecessary because the name of the place was originally only 'Monas' and when people read the word 'Monas', they will definitely understand that it is located in Jakarta. The word 'there' is also unnecessary because it is usually used to show the place but in the previous sentence the name of the place has

been mentioned so it is unnecessary to put the word 'there'. The correct sentence should be '*...I visited Monas...*'. The addition error caused by intralingual transfer is also found in the case of the use of 'apostrophe s' or ('s) . The use of 'apostrophe s' in English is to show ownership. The example of the addition error is in this sentence written by Hilda Dian '*...the drama's performance...*'. The use of 'apostrophe s' in the previous example is unnecessary because the sentence does not mean to show an ownership. The correct one should be '*...the drama performance...*'. Another example is written by Nafis Sinta '*...the women's team...*'. What is meant by the student is 'a team that contain only female students in it', thus the sentence does not show an ownership. The correct one should be '*...the women/female team...*'.

Meanwhile some examples of misformation error in the sentences that are caused by intralingual transfer is mostly in the word changing from as like '*...all students **get** food...*' instead of '*...all students **got** food...*', '*...my family and I **go** home...*' instead of '*...my family and I **went** home...*', '*...this activity **lasts** for 2 hours...*' instead of '*...this activity **lasted** for 2 hours...*', '*...who **has** a hobby of reading...*' instead of '*...who **had** a hobby of reading...*', '*...I **don't** think...*' instead of '*...I **didn't** think...*', '*...which only **come** out...*' instead of '*...which only **came** out...*', '*...when we **wake** up...*' instead of '*...when we **woke** up...*'.

‘...school activities **take** a lot of time...’ instead of ‘...school activities took a lot of time...’, ‘...some students **bring** mats...’ instead of ‘...some students brought mats...’, ‘...we **hold** a closing ceremony...’ instead of ‘...we held a closing ceremony...’, ‘...the weather **starts** to change...’ instead of ‘...the weather started to change...’, ‘...one of them **sells** souvenirs...’ instead of ‘...one of them sold souvenirs...’, ‘...I **eat** meatballs...’ instead of ‘...I ate meatballs...’, ‘...so I **am** sure...’ instead of ‘...so I was sure...’, ‘...which **is** usually...’ instead of ‘...which was usually...’, and ‘...all students **are** asked to...’ instead of ‘...all students were asked to...’, ‘...I think it **will** be...’ instead of ‘...I think it would be...’, ‘...that I **cannot** make into reality...’ instead of ‘...that I could not make into reality...’, and others. Another case is where students cannot use the correct form of word whether it is a noun, a verb, an adjective and others as like in these examples, ‘...I spent it like **usually** by staying at home...’ instead of ‘...I spent it like usual by staying at home...’. In the previous sentence, the adjective one is more suitable to be used. Another example is ‘...at noon, I **took** a lunch...’. The more suitable word used should be ‘...at noon, I had lunch...’, and others.